West Valley – Mission Community College District

Classified and Administrative Recruitment and Selection Procedures

Administrative Procedures to Board Policy 3.1.3, Selection and Recruitment Guidelines

Prepared by Human Resources
April 2006

Classified and Administrative Recruitment and Selection Procedures

Administrative Procedures to Board Policy 3.1.3, Selection and Recruitment Guidelines

Table of Contents:

Introduction 1

Step 1 – Recruitment Approval 1

Step 2 – Establish Committee, Designate Committee Chair, and Responsibilities of Committee and Committee Chair 1

Establish Committee 1

Selection of Committee Chair 3

Submission of Committee Members Form 3

Committee Member Responsibilities 3

Committee Chair Responsibilities 4

Step 3 – Preparation of Job Announcement 4

Step 4 – Recruitment Advertising 5

Step 5 – Developing Paper Screening Criteria and Rating Form 5

Developing Paper Screening Criteria 5

Final Approval 6

Step 6 – Interview Preparation, Developing the Interview Criteria, Interview Questions, and Rating Mechanism 6

Interview Preparation 6

Developing Interview Criteria and Interview Questions 7

Developing Follow-up Questions 7

Developing a Written Exercise, Presentation, or Role Play 8

Developing the Rating Mechanism 8

Submission of Documents 8

Step 7 – Human Resources Review of Initial Applicant Pool and Minimum Qualifications 9

Step 8 – Committee Paper Screening 10

Paper Screening Information 10

Conflict of Interest 10

Paper Screening Method 10

Paper Screening Deliberation Process 11

Step 9 – Scheduling Interviews 12

Step 10 – Interview Day 13

Welcome and Information 13

Committee Interview 14

Step 11 – Reference Checking Process 16

Reference Check Component 16

Reference Checking Period 16

Responsibility of Making References 16

Reference Checking Steps 17

Step 12 – Recommendation of Employment 18

Step 13 – Finalist Interviews 18

Step 14 – Job Offer 19

Step 15 – Appointment 20

Appendices:

Personnel Requisition and Recruitment Form ..... Appendix A

Committee Members ..... Appendix B

Recruitment Advertising Plan ..... Appendix C

Paper Screening Criteria and Rating Document (Example) ..... Appendix D

Interview Criteria and Questions Document (Example) ..... Appendix D-1

WVMCCD Application Pre-Screening Form ..... Appendix E

Applicant Flow Chart ..... Appendix F

Individual Committee Member Ranking Form ..... Appendix G

Committee Composite Ranking Form ..... Appendix H

Committee Composite Ranking Form – Page 2 ..... Appendix H-1

Interview Confirmation Letter (Example) ..... Appendix I

Administrator Benefit Summary ..... Appendix J-1

Classified Benefit Summary ..... Appendix J-2

Deliberation of Finalists – Committee Composite Rating ..... Appendix K

Classified Reference Check Form ..... Appendix L

Administrator Reference Check Form ..... Appendix L-1

Last Page of Employment Application ..... Appendix M

Recommendation for Employment Form ..... Appendix N

Strengths and Weaknesses Form ..... Appendix N-1

Request for Candidate Reimbursement Form ..... Appendix O

Classified and Administrative Recruitment and Selection Procedures

Administrative Procedures to Board Policy 3.1.3, Selection and Recruitment Guidelines

Introduction

Thank you for your interest and willingness to participate in the recruitment and selection process. Those persons involved in the selection of new classified and administrative staff are agents of the Board of Trustees empowered to help select the best candidates. Because you are an agent of the Governing Board, you will be held accountable for every aspect of the process. Your participation is an investment of your time, knowledge and skills. You have the professional responsibility to follow all policies and procedures. These procedures have been established to guard against litigation as long as they are faithfully followed and in doing so, the District will defend committee members should litigation result.

STEP 1 – Recruitment Approval

1. Contact the Administrative Specialist for Personnel at the college or the Human Resources Specialist – Recruitment (HR Specialist) for the appropriate documents to be completed and returned. **(Appendix A)**
2. Return forms to the Administrative Specialist who will process at the college level and forward to Human Resources to obtain approval through the Executive Management Team (EMT).

STEP 2 – Establish Committee, Designate Committee Chair, and Responsibilities of Committee and Committee Chair

A. Establish Committee

1. Classified: The committee for classified positions shall be initiated by the department supervisor / manager. The classified representatives will be appointed by the appropriate Classified Senate* committee and shall be from three to five members and subject to approval by the appropriate Vice President, Vice Chancellor or Chancellor. To ensure balance and perspective, there shall be representatives from outside the department (at least 1 if three committee members and 2 if there are 4 or 5 members). Outside the department is defined as a separate department with a different manager from the immediate supervisor of the position to be filled.

   *The Classified Senate after notification from the department supervisor/manager will have ten working days to identify the classified representatives. If not received, the department manager may appoint the representatives and will send a confirmation to the Classified Senate.

2. Administrative: The committee for administrative positions shall be initiated by the immediate supervisor. The immediate supervisor will contact the representative groups, in writing, to obtain the names of appointees. The groups will have ten working days to make their appointments. The representation shall be as follows:

Chancellor

- 5 administrators (two administrators from each college and one from Administrative Services appointed by the Board of Trustees)
- 2 Academic Senate representatives (one from each college appointed by the Academic Senate)
- 2 Classified Senate representatives (one from each college appointed by the Classified Senate – *confidential, police and supervisory employees may also be appointed*)
- 1 administrative services representative appointed by the Board of Trustees
- 2 students (one from each college appointed by the Associated Students)
- 1 community member appointed by the Board of Trustees

Vice Chancellor and Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources

- 4 administrative representatives (one administrator from each college and two representatives from Administrative Services, at least one an administrator, appointed by the Chancellor)
- 2 Academic Senate representatives (one from each college appointed by the Academic Senate)
- 2 Classified Senate representatives (one from each college appointed by the Classified Senate – *confidential, police and supervisory employees may also be appointed*)
- 2 students (one from each college appointed by the Associated Students)

College President

- 4 administrators to include representation from Administrative Services appointed by the Chancellor
- 2 Academic Senate representatives appointed by the Academic Senate
- 2 Classified Senate representatives appointed by the Classified Senate
- 1 student appointed by the Associated Students (one student minimum)
- 1 community representative appointed by the Chancellor

College Vice President

- 4 administrators appointed by the College President
- 2 Academic Senate representatives appointed by the Academic Senate
- 2 Classified Senate representatives appointed by the Classified Senate
- 1 student appointed by the Associated Students (one student minimum)
- 1 community representative appointed by the Chancellor

Other Academic Administrators

- 4 administrators appointed by the Chancellor, Vice Chancellor, or College President as appropriate
- 2 Academic Senate representatives appointed by the Academic Senate
- 2 Classified Senate representatives appointed by the Classified Senate student appointed by the Associated Students (optional for administrative services positions)

Other Classified Administrators

- 2 administrators appointed by the Chancellor, Vice Chancellor, or College President as appropriate
- 1 Academic Senate representative appointed by the Academic Senate
- 1 Classified Senate representative appointed by the Classified Senate
- 1 student appointed by the Associated Students (optional)

<u>Note</u>: Failure of a group to select representatives will not negate the process; one group cannot add additional members due to the lack of appointees from another group.

3. Subject to approval of the appropriate administrator noted above, the committee may also include professionals or others outside of the District who can contribute expertise to the selection process.
4. The committee will reflect diversity and inclusiveness which includes, but is not limited to, such qualities as gender, race / ethnicity, age, disability, sexual orientation, and perspective.
5. It is expected that committee members will participate in the recruitment and selection process from the beginning to the end. However, in some cases this is not possible. In order to ensure fairness to the applicants, a committee member's ratings/scores can only be counted if he / she completes an entire paper screening or interview process. This means that if a committee member screens or interviews only a portion of the applicants, none of their ratings / scores can be counted. Another example is when a committee member has a conflict with one of the candidates on the day of the interview and says I can't participate in this interview but I will evaluate the other candidates. The committee member must excuse him/herself from the entire interview process.
6. Committee members may be substituted during the process as long as it is acceptable to the appropriate reporting manager and diversity and inclusiveness are maintained as noted above.
7. If committee members are changed after the official notification has been submitted, a revised Committee form must be submitted and re-certified by the appropriate administrator responsible for the selection process and the Human Resources Department.

B. Selection of Committee Chair

The committee chair will be selected by the committee.

C. Submission of Committee Members Form

When the committee has been established, complete the Committee Members form and return it to Human Resources. **(Appendix B)**

D. Committee Member Responsibilities:

1. Demonstrating objectivity, fairness, and equality of treatment of all applicants
2. Commitment to the process
3. Maintaining the integrity of the process
4. Strict confidentiality of the process which means no discussion outside of the committee to include, but is not limited to, releasing the names of applicants, numbers of applicants and finalists, where the applicants work, their degrees, etc. There will be no side discussions of applicants and their qualifications outside of the full committee's participation. What occurs in the selection process stays within the committee before, during and after the selection has been made. The exception to this regulation is when a committee member or step in the process is not being followed appropriately or the process has been compromised. If this is the case, contact the Human Resources Department immediately for guidance.
5. Working cooperatively to meet the established timeline to fill the position
6. Determining the desired qualifications for the position that will ensure the candidate's successfulness
7. Submitting names of professional organizations, web sites, publications and journals specific to the position for advertising purposes; if providing a mailing list, submit on mailing labels
8. Developing the supplemental questions to be used in the paper screening process, developing the paper screening form, developing the interview questions, and developing the rating

mechanism ensuring that all of the above are job-related specifically to the position and are so noted in the job announcement. Using the established forms for paper screening and interviewing; maintaining your notes on the established forms; if additional sheets are used to record notes, they are to be attached to the actual forms.

9. Participating in both the paper screening and interviewing of the candidates.
10. Signing all rating forms and totaling scores to ensure accuracy
11. No copying or removing of applicant's application documents, paper screening and interview forms for personal or other use
12. Reporting procedural errors to the committee chair
13. Submitting all documents used in the selection process to the committee chair
14. Making no contacts with applicants unless authorized by the committee chair and approved by Human Resources

E. Committee Chair Responsibilities:

1. Providing active leadership in the steps of the selection process (paper screening, interviews and reference checking)
2. Following the recruitment timeline as determined by the reporting manager or Executive Management Team member as appropriate.
3. Keeping all recruitment and selection documents in a secure location during paper screening and between interviews.
4. Organizing and managing of committee's operation
5. Ensuring the steps of the process are followed
6. Notifying the Human Resources Department of procedural errors to request guidance and direction
7. Submitting of all documents used in the selection process to Human Resources
8. Coordinating interviews to include dates, times and location
9. Working closely with the college Administrative Specialist for Personnel and the Human Resources Specialist – Recruitment

STEP 3 – Preparation of Job Announcement

1. The college Administrative Specialist for Personnel will send you a job announcement template and job description. If available, the previous job announcement will also be provided.
2. The college Administrative Specialist for Personnel will also provide each committee member with a copy of these procedures.
3. The job announcement will include the minimum qualifications and / or any desirable qualifications in the Board approved job description. Committees may not include any additional minimum or desirable qualifications.
4. You may develop supplemental questions to be included as a requirement in the application process to assist you in the paper screening process, but supplemental questions are not a requirement. The supplemental questions must be related to the paper screening criteria which are defined in Step 5. It will be helpful to develop the paper screening criteria before you develop the supplemental questions.
5. The job description will be included in the job announcement (Board approved); you may make minor changes to the description as a result of changes in job titles mentioned within the description, etc. If in doubt, contact the Human Resources Department.
6. You may not change other elements of the job announcement, such as salary and benefits, and selection process. However, you may make suggestions as Human Resources wants to improve the information provided to the public.
7. Return your draft to the college Administrative Specialist for Personnel.

STEP 4 – Recruitment Advertising

Upon submission of the job announcement and supplemental questions, the Human Resources Department will develop a Recruitment Advertising Plan **(Appendix C)** for the position based on recommended publications and journals from the committee and others determined by the Human Resources Department. Administrative positions are advertised in the California Community Colleges Registry, Chronicle of Higher Education, Higheredjobs.com, various ethnic publications and web sites. We will advertise in publications specific to the assignment as requested. Classified positions are advertised within a 75-mile radius. Sometimes jobs receive additional public exposure when new advertisements are placed in publications as they are again included in the latest advertisement.

Please note that some publications may require a month or more notice or they only publish every other month so we will not, in some cases, be able to meet the deadlines.

Publications usually appear once. Depending on the cost, Human Resources may pay for more than one advertisement. Additional publication dates can be included providing the expense is borne by the college and / or division / department.

The Human Resources Department is tracking the information provided by applicants on where they heard about the position. This information will be used in the future to determine the success rates of the best publications to reach different job categories.

If you are expecting to attend conferences or workshops and you would like application materials to take with you, contact the Human Resources Specialist - Recruitment. Please give the staff a reasonable period to time for preparation.

Committees may not prepare their own job announcements or advertise for positions.

STEP 5 – Developing Paper Screening Criteria and Rating Form (See Appendix D)

The purpose of the paper screening form is to assess the knowledge, skills and abilities of the applicants to determine who best meets the job-related criteria included in the job announcement to warrant a personal interview with the committee. To accomplish this, the committee must develop paper screening criteria and a paper screening form to include a rating mechanism. The paper screening criteria must be based on information you can obtain from the application materials.

A. Developing Paper Screening Criteria

To ensure that all committee members understand how and what to evaluate and to ensure consistency among the committee in the paper screening process, you are encouraged to establish standard paper screening criteria pertinent to the position. If you asked the candidates to complete supplemental questions, these must also be included in the paper screening document. Use the job description as your guide to develop the paper screening criteria.

The following are examples of paper screening criteria for a Student Services Technician:

1. Knowledge and background to perform the essential functions of the position (as demonstrated in breadth / depth in any college preparation, other skills or job-related experiences)
2. Knowledge of computer hardware and software (as demonstrated in application documents)
3. Written communication skills (as demonstrated in presentation of application materials)

4. Sensitivity to diverse academic, socioeconomic, cultural, disability, and ethnic backgrounds of community college students (as demonstrated in application explanation and other documents)

You may not evaluate the candidates on where they obtained their education, on the number of degrees they possess, and how many years of experience they possess as none of these are proven examples of competency. Any strength(s) of the candidates to measure desirable qualifications can be addressed in the above paper screening criteria.

Once you have determined the paper screening criteria, develop the rating mechanism to be used, such as a scale from 0 to 5 with 5 being the highest possible score or 0 to 10 with 10 being the highest. You are discouraged from using numbers higher than 10 as it is meaningless because total points are no longer used. The scale should be relatively close in numbers to ensure that one criterion is not move overrated than another. You may want to give weight to one or more paper screening criteria, such as 0-5 x 3 (maximum earnable is 15 points) rather than using 0-15 points. For example, you may want to have more emphasis on "knowledge and background" than written communication skills. Keep in mind that all of the paper screening criteria are important when selecting who will be successful, including the sensitivity criteria.

You may also want to define what the 0-5 or 0-10 means in the terms of scoring. For example, 0-5 may mean: 0 – didn't answer; 1 – 2 fair; 3 – 4 average, 4 – above average; 5 – excellent. After you have developed the rating mechanism and any weighting, please review the ratings in totality to ensure that you are satisfied with the outcome.

Submit documents to the college Administrative Specialist for Personnel who will review and forward to the Human Resources Department.

B. Final Approval

The Human Resources Department will have final approval of the paper screening document. The Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources may modify or delete selection criteria that may be perceived as bias. For example, if the criterion is "possesses community college admissions and records experience," this will be deleted. No analysis has been completed to determine that prior community college experience in the admissions and records office is a predictor of an excellent employee. Nor has it been determined that the criteria does not have an adverse impact on underrepresented ethnic groups, women, and the disabled. The Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources may also recommend additional questions to ensure a comprehensive interview is conducted.

The committee may not revise the paper screening form after submission to Human Resources. If there is a problem, contact the Human Resources Department for assistance.

STEP 6 – Interview Preparation, Developing the Interview Criteria, Interview Questions, and Rating Mechanism

A. Interview Preparation

There are several business items the committee must decide upon prior to the actual interviews which may have an impact on developing the interview criteria.

1. Tardiness of candidates: The committee must decide if they are going to accept the late candidate for an interview at the time they arrive or later in the day, another day or not at all. The committee is encouraged to ask for a reason for the tardiness because it may be a legitimate reason such as a freeway traffic accident. You are encouraged to

accommodate the candidates with legitimate reasons as you are limiting your qualified pool.

2. Determining the performance indicator: Give considerable thought to include the indicator, the location of the interviews to ensure there is adequate space to give a presentation or conduct a role play, chalk board, PowerPoint available equipment, overhead projector, a computer to complete an exercise, etc. If the candidate is required to create a spreadsheet or word document, the candidates must be notified at the time of interview the software they will be using, etc.
3. First and finalists interviews: Plan tentative dates with all committee members present to ensure a timely process. Allow time for the review process by the Vice President and Human Resources to occur plus ten days notification to the candidates to make arrangements to participate in the interviews. Be flexible as we want to hire the best candidate for the position. You may lose an excellent candidate because you are trying to make an internal deadline.

B. Developing Interview Criteria and Interview Questions

Based on the same criteria as noted above under paper screening, the committee should develop specific interview criteria and the questions to assess the candidate's ability to meet the criteria. The interview criteria are the bold statements that indicate the committee's focus is to select the best-qualified candidate for the job. The interview criteria must be comprehensive and cover all characteristics and knowledge that we expect the employee to possess. The following are suggested interview criteria for the Student Services Technician that may be modified to fit the specific position:

1. Knowledge and background preparation
2. Understands the academic environment and the mission to serve students
3. Problem-solving skills
4. Knowledge of computer hardware and software
5. Sensitivity to diversity (academic, cultural, ethnic, socioeconomic and the disabled) *
6. Interpersonal skills and mutual respect to be effective with students and staff
7. Verbal communication skills
8. Written communication skills may be included if you are requesting a written exercise

Once the interview criteria are developed, the committee develops the interview questions (one or more) for each of the interview criterion to assess each candidate's knowledge, skills, and abilities. This is very important because this keeps the committee members focused on the reason for the question so they do not evaluate, for example, problem-solving skills when the question focuses on knowledge of multiple teaching methods.

* The Human Resources Department has developed some interview questions to assist the committee in assessing the interview criterion. Title 5 requires that meaningful consideration be given to which applicants fully demonstrate their sensitivity and understanding. Merely having experience working with diversity does not demonstrate their specific sensitivity and understanding.

C. Developing Follow-up Questions

Sometimes in interviews individual committee members have a desire to want to ask questions of individuals to obtain additional information that are not in the pre-approved interview questions. Although it is not illegal to do so, you are cautioned in this loose practice as it could be perceived by other committee members that you are trying to embarrass or promote one candidate over another candidate by obtaining additional information. Therefore, you are encouraged to develop follow-up questions in advance and include them in the interview questions. For example, you may ask the

question, “Describe a conflict you have experienced with another person in the workplace and explain how you handled it.” Your follow-up questions might be: If a similar conflict occurred again, would you handle it differently? If yes, explain what you would do differently and why? If the answer is no, why not? What did you learn from the experience?

Developing follow-up questions requires the committee to answer the questions themselves to ensure the question is effective and the answer is what you are looking for in a response.

D. Developing a Written Exercise, Presentation, or Role Play

After the interview criteria and interview questions are developed, the committee’s next step is to determine if a written exercise, presentation, role play or other exercise will be a part of the interview. Whatever the activity, you must develop the evaluation criteria. For example, you may choose a computer exercise for the Student Services Technician position wherein the candidate must prepare an excel spreadsheet. The goal of the exercise is to determine if the person is knowledgeable in the use of an excel spreadsheet because it is critical to the position. The evaluation criteria might be:

- Candidate followed directions
- Document was accurately prepared
- Document was professional to include title, date, etc.

E. Developing the Rating Mechanism

Now that you have the interview criteria, interview questions, exercise and evaluation criteria completed, the next and final step is to determine the rating mechanism, such as a scale from 0 to 5 with 5 being the highest possible score or 0-10 with 10 being the highest. You are discouraged from using numbers higher than 10 as it is meaningless because total points are no longer used. You may also want to give weight to one or more interview criteria. For example, you may want to have more emphasis on “knowledge and background” instead of **“**written communication skills.**”** Keep in mind that all of the above are equally important when selecting a person who will be successful, including the sensitivity criteria. After you have developed the rating mechanism and any weighting, please review the ratings in totality to ensure that you are satisfied with the outcome. Caution: Sometimes weighting may result in the exercise having more emphasis than the oral interview which may skew the total interview.

F. Submission of Documents

Submit a typed or emailed document to include the interview criteria, the specific questions to address the criteria, any exercise, evaluation criteria, and rating mechanism to the college Administrative Specialist for Personnel for the colleges and directly to Human Resources for District Office positions. The Administrative Specialist for Personnel will obtain Vice President approval for classified positions and President approval for administrative positions. The immediate supervisor of a District Office vacant position will obtain approval from the Associate Vice Chancellor, Vice Chancellor or Chancellor as appropriate.

The form must include a place for the candidate’s name, plenty of room to take interview notes, a line for each question score, the total score, a place for the rater’s signature, and date. The following is an example of interview criteria and questions:

Criteria: Knowledge and background preparation

Sample Questions to address this selection criterion:

Please describe how your background and experience has prepared you to perform the duties of the Student Services Technician.	Rate 0-5	_____
This position requires interaction with students and staff on an on-going basis. Please describe your experience in dealing with the public. What tips or techniques do you use?	Rate 0-5	_____

Criteria: Problem-solving skills

Sample Question to address this selection criterion:

Please describe a problem you experienced in your last job that left you with a lasting memory. What did you learn from the experience? How do you approach similar problems now?	Rate 0-5	_____

The last question of the interview should include the opportunity for the candidate to ask questions about the position. This question is unrated. They may ask when a selection is to be made, etc. Do not give specific dates. Tell them that if they are selected for a second interview, they will be notified verbally. Candidates not selected for a second interview will be notified in writing by Human Resources.

The committee may not revise the interview criteria, interview questions, etc. after submission to Human Resources. If there is a problem, contact the Human Resources Department for assistance.

The applications will be released to the interview committee upon submission and approval of the paper screening and interview forms to the Human Resources Department.

STEP 7 – Human Resources Review of Initial Applicant Pool and Minimum Qualifications

When the recruitment has closed, Human Resources will analyze the initial pool of applicants to determine if the applicant pool meets the expected representation as required by Title 5. This could be a factor that would require the recruitment for the position to be extended for further outreach. If this does not occur, the applicant pool meets or exceeds the expected representation and the selection process may move forward. The recruitment may also be extended due to an inadequate number of applicants based on employment trends. The Human Resources Department will also analyze the recruitment plan.

If the initial pool meets the expected representation, the Human Resources Department will screen the applications using the WVMCCD Application Pre-screening Form **(Appendix E).** It is the committee's responsibility to paper screen all applications provided for their review. Every committee member must complete a paper screening form for each application.

The Human Resources Department will develop an Applicant Flow Chart **(Appendix F)** for each recruitment to record a history of the applicants during every phase of the selection process.

STEP 8 – Committee Paper Screening

A. Paper Screening Information

The committee may not revise the paper screening form after submission to Human Resources. If there is a problem, contact the Human Resources Department for assistance.

Each committee member will paper screen each applicant. There are exceptions to this rule and they are:

- The committee member becomes ill and cannot participate in order to meet the selection timeline of the committee.
- One of the committee members is a student or someone outside the District and cannot meet the selection timeline of the committee.

It is not the committee's responsibility to re-determine if an applicant meets minimum or equivalent qualifications.

If the applicant pool is small, the committee may agree to bypass the paper screening process and interview all applicants. If this is the case, the committee chair should send an email to the Administrative Specialist for Personnel. However, the committee members should attempt to review each application prior to the interview day.

B. Conflict of Interest

If during the paper screening process a committee member has a conflict of interest with one of the applicants, the committee member must excuse his / herself from the committee at this time. The committee member may no longer participate in the selection process. It is not acceptable for the committee member to paper screen all other applicants and excuse him / herself from paper screening the one applicant for which the committee member has a conflict. If this occurs, the paper screening process has been compromised. The committee member may be replaced.

A conflict is when the committee member recognizes by verbal notification or in the paper screening process that an applicant is a family member or close friend that compromises the committee member in making an unbiased decision in the selection process. A conflict is also when you know a lot of negative information about an applicant that impairs your objectivity to assess the applicant fairly. The committee member must notify the committee chair immediately.

The committee must meet to discuss the conflicts (not the specifics, such as: the negative information to further compromise the applicant by the other committee members) and make a decision to replace or not replace the committee member. The decision must be unanimous. If the committee decides to keep the committee member and the conflict is because the applicant is a family member or close friend, a written notification must be sent to Human Resources to document to the file.

<u>Note</u>: It is inappropriate to be sharing any additional information (positive or negative) you may know or think you know about a candidate. Use the reference check process to validate the character, work history and work ethic of the candidates.

C. Paper Screening Method

The method of using total points as we have used in the past has many problems and may no longer be used. The following are examples of problems with the total point method:

- The method provides the opportunity for committee member bias to occur; for example, if two committee members want a particular candidate they will rate high to improve the applicant's chances of being interviewed.
- This method also can work in reverse. If committee members are not interested in a particular candidate, they will give the person a low score. This particular method is more difficult to defend in litigation because of potential bias.

Individual Committee Member Ranking **(Appendix G)**:

Each committee member adds up each score of each applicant and then ranks each applicant, for example 1 to 10 if there are ten applicants. There can be no ties in the process. The simplest way to resolve the ties is to reassess applicant scores.

If you feel you cannot avoid ties, the following method must be used. If there are 10 applicants and a committee member has a tie score for #1, the committee member may break the tie by re-evaluating the score or breaking the tie numerically. Since there are two top candidates with the same score, in reality they occupy positions #1 and #2; therefore each receive a ranking of 1.5 and 1.5 (position 1 plus position 2 = 3 divided by 2 people who have a tie vote = 1.5 each). The next applicant would receive a 3 because the 1st and 2nd slots are already taken. This same process can be used if there were three (or more) people. For example, three people have a top tie score, their rankings by the committee member using the same formula would be 2 (#1 + #2 + #3 = 6 divided by 3 applicants = 2). The next top rated candidate would receive a ranking of #4 because the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd slots are already taken.

The committee must complete the Individual Committee Member Ranking Form and attach all interview forms and submit to the committee chair.

Committee Composite Ranking:

After the individual scores are completed by each committee member, the committee chair completes the Committee Composite Ranking form **(Appendix H)** based on each committee member's individual rankings. The applicant with the lowest score is the top candidate by the committee.

D. Paper Screening Deliberation Process

The committee chair will share the results of the composite committee rankings with the committee.
The committee members will discuss the applicants as related to the pre-approved paper screening form.

The deliberation process has the potential to include other inappropriate discussions that are taken into consideration in the decision making process. The following are examples of inappropriate matters to avoid:

Avoid discussions concerning:

- Additional paper screening criteria not included in the pre-approved form
- Discussions of race, gender, sexual orientation, and disability
- Personal bias
- Information you have heard or know about an applicant
- An applicant's responses to the general questions on the application form

Be responsible and if you have any doubt about a topic of discussion, do not discuss it.

During the deliberation process the committee members must decide based on the composite scores of the applicants, how many will be invited to an interview. The composite scores will give a clear picture of how many to invite. Instead of limiting your invitees, you should be more inclusive for the following reasons:

- You are screening based on the presentation of their materials; this is not a true reflection of the applicant's knowledge, skills and abilities.
- You are not sure if the applicant completed the application documents; there are agencies offering this service for a fee.
- You are screening based on how much education and experience they have and more does not necessarily mean better.
- You will likely lose candidates when you schedule the interviews and after you have scheduled the interviews.
- If you want to find the best qualified person, take the time and be more inclusive and interview as many applicants as possible.
- Being more inclusive is evidence that the committee is making a good faith effort to be more inclusive in response to the District's equal opportunity employment commitment and to meet Title 5 requirements.

The deliberation process will be scrutinized by the appropriate Vice President and the Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources to ensure the process is conducted in an appropriate manner. For example, if the committee paper screens 30 applicants and only offers 5 interviews, this is suspect. This has the perception that there may be a hidden agenda, which must be investigated. In reality, if 30 people meet the minimum qualifications, the committee should be inviting more than 5 candidates. Furthermore, inviting only 5 may result in fewer actually accepting your invitation limiting your candidate pool.

The appropriate administrator or the Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources may require that you interview more than five. Furthermore, if the process is compromised in any way, the Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources has the authority of the Chancellor to stop the process at any time.

Any decision by the appropriate administrator and the Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources is not intended to negate the hard work of the committee, but it is the responsibility of everyone to ensure our selection processes support equal opportunity employment and fairness to all applicants. It is everyone's objective to employ the best qualified person for the position.

After the deliberation process is finalized and the Vice President has approved the recommendations of the committee, the committee chair shall submit all applications, committee member screening forms, and the paper screening results form to the college Administrative Specialist for Personnel who will forward the documents to Human Resources.

Important Note: The committee members may not duplicate the paper screening forms of any applicants. These documents are confidential District Office records, not committee member records or college records.

STEP 9 – Scheduling Interviews

It is the responsibility of the committee chair to:

- coordinate the dates, times and location of the interviews in consultation with the committee. Out-of-state candidates must be given a ten-day notice to make transportation arrangements to

participate in the interview. So plan ahead and be as accommodating as possible. Candidates invited to the first interview are responsible for their expenses;

- arrange for contacting the candidates; mail a confirmation to the candidates of the interview date, time, location and any other performance indicators that you plan for the candidates to prepare for such as a presentation, a map and a parking permit; and attach a copy of the confirmation to the candidate's application;
- prepare a clean copy of the interview questions that do not show selection criteria and rating mechanism for the candidates to review on the day of the interviews;
- review the Human Resources pre-screening form attached to the application to see if the candidate is required to bring additional documentation to the interview. If so, remind them at the time of interview notification and in the confirmation letter;
- arrange for a contact person to have the candidates report to;
- assure the contact person is knowledgeable of his/her responsibilities; and
- assure the process is followed consistently for all candidates.

Committee members should assist the committee chair whenever possible.

Important Note: There will no longer be courtesy interviews to out-of-state candidates to avoid returning for a second interview.

STEP 10 – Interview Day

The hiring process involves the evaluation of people for a position. It is at the same time the candidates are evaluating whether they want to work at the West Valley-Mission Community College District.

Your goal is to present yourself in such a way that all candidates exposed to the process go away feeling that West Valley-Mission Community College District is the only institution with which they want to work. This principle, of course, applies to every stage of the hiring procedures, but nowhere is it more relevant than in the interview process, when the candidates and the committee, representing the institution, come face-to-face.

The committee should strive to make the interview process humane and to create a relaxed atmosphere conducive to the candidate's doing his or her best.

A. Welcome and Information

When the candidate reports to the contact person, they are to be given 5 to 10 minutes to preview the interview questions which must not include the selection criteria or rating mechanism. Whatever the time limit the committee determines, it must be consistently applied to every candidate. If the candidate makes notes and brings them into the interview from this brief review, don't be alarmed. The person is probably jotting notes to remember during the interview. What is not acceptable is for the candidate to bring a brief case of documentation to review after every question is asked. If this occurs, the committee chair should be kind and tell the candidate that the committee prefers responses to the questions directly from the candidate without reference to other documents. This should resolve the problem and not impede the process.

<u>Important Note</u>: Sometimes candidates bring letters of reference, performance evaluations or other documentation to leave with the committee at the time of the interview. The committee chair is to thank the candidate for providing the information. This information is <u>not</u> to be reviewed by the committee members, nor can any of the information be taken into consideration as part of the evaluation of the candidate. The committee chair is to keep this information in their possession to be returned to Human Resources with a note of explanation.

B. Committee Interview

All candidates are on a level-playing field, meaning no consideration is given in the interview process for the paper screening process.

1. Preliminary:

- The committee should have a copy of the job announcement and a copy of the interview questions for the candidate to refer to, if necessary.
- Welcome the candidate and thank him/her for their interest in employment in the District. The committee should introduce themselves. It is also helpful if there are name plates for each committee member.
- Explain the interview process: Such as how the questions will be asked, indicate the committee will be taking notes and may not have direct eye contact but to feel assured the committee is listening carefully to everything they are saying.
- Tell them they may refer to the interview questions at any time during the interview.
- Tell them they will have an opportunity at the end of the interview to ask questions.
- Refer to the actual Human Resources pre-screening form attached to the front of the application to see if Human Resources included any directions for the committee chair such as obtaining signature on application or requiring additional documentation to be submitted at the time of the interview. If this is appropriate, please follow-up.

2. Interviews:

<u>Note</u>: Candidates may have jotted down a couple of notes when previewing the interview questions. Do not be alarmed as this is acceptable. However, please retrieve these notes before they leave the interview. This excludes any handouts provided for a presentation or activity you requested the candidate to present as part of the interview.

Now that the preliminary procedures are completed, the committee may conduct the interviews assuring every applicant is asked the same questions.

If interviews are conducted on more than one day, the committee chair is responsible for retrieving the interview screening forms from the committee members and keeping them in a secure location until the interviews resume.

After each interview, the committee is encouraged not to discuss the candidates. This dialogue can be perceived as a mechanism to insert individual biases about candidates into the process. Each committee member has the responsibility to evaluate each candidate from his/her own perspective and not to be influenced by others. Everyone will have an opportunity to discuss the candidates during the deliberation process.

Every committee member must complete an interview form for each candidate. You are encouraged to keep job-related notes on the candidate's responses. If you do not keep notes on the interview form and you use other paper, the document must be attached to the interview form and submitted to the committee chair at the appropriate time. In the event of any challenge to the committee's process, the

committee may have to provide specific points as to why he/she gave one candidate a 5 rating and another candidate a 2 rating. After a long period of time, it is unlikely that you will remember every detail and the committee's process could be suspect.

At the close of the interviews, give the candidates an opportunity to ask questions.

If a candidate wants to give you documentation during or after the interview with the exception of an outline of presentation or whatever performance indicator you requested them to do, you can respond in one of two ways: Accept the information and say thank you or tell the candidate in fairness to all candidates, we cannot accept the documents. If you accept the information, the committee chair is to keep the information in his/her possession which is not to be shared with committee members or used in the deliberation process.

Before they leave, give them a copy of the benefit information **(Appendix J-2).** Also let them know that second level (finalist) interviews are customary.

Important Note:

- **The committee members may not duplicate the interview forms or any attached documentation for their records. These documents are confidential District records.**
- **Video teleconferencing interviews are not available.**

3. Deliberations:

The committee may follow the same process outlined in Step 8, which includes the completion of committee member ranking forms and the committee chair completing the committee composite ranking form.

The committee may choose an alternative method in a joint meeting as follows:

- Each committee member shall identify their top five candidates in ranked order. There can be no ties.
- The committee chair shall complete the Deliberation of Finalists – Committee Composite Rating form **(Appendix K).**
- After the top five candidates of all committee members have been included on the form, a counting is conducted of how many votes each candidate received.
- The committee must decide based on the votes each candidate received how many candidates are finalists of the committee.

Whatever process the committee uses, the candidates must be discussed. The strengths and weaknesses of the finalists must be developed. In addition, you must develop a brief rationale for each finalist to be included in the Recommendation of Employment form.

The deliberation process is very important. You will be selecting finalists who meet all of the interview criteria. The dialogue must be job-related and there must be no discussion about race, gender, cultures, and / or disabilities of the candidates. The goal is to hire the best qualified person that meets all of the pre-determined interview criteria to include sensitivity to the diversity of our students. If he / she demonstrated a strong grasp of the job tasks to be performed but demonstrated weaknesses in interpersonal skills and problem solving, then this is not the person we should select.

You may not consider the responses to the general questions located in the application during the deliberation process. If necessary, these responses will be resolved in either the reference check process or the final review by Human Resources.

4. Finalists:

If possible, the recommended candidates for the second interview should have consensus of the committee. However, consensus may not be achieved. If this is the case, a majority of the committee may forward recommended candidates. A committee member is not required to change their points of a candidate to reflect the decision of the committee.

Caution: The recommended candidates should mirror the ranking of the candidates as a result of the interview. If this does not occur, there is a cause for concern and the process may appear suspect. If there is conflict between the committee members, contact your Vice President.

STEP 11 – Reference Checking Process (Appendix L)

The purpose of reference checking is to confirm the information obtained in the interview, to confirm information submitted on the employment application, and to ensure the selected person is the right person for the job. The reference check process should be taken seriously and completed as thoroughly as possible in the event the District and the committee members are subjected to accusations of negligent hiring.

There is one reference check form for faculty and classified **(Appendix L)** and one for management **(Appendix L-1)**.

A. Reference Check Component

There are two components to the reference checking process: one is completed by the committee and the other is completed by Human Resources. The committee assesses the candidate's knowledge, skills and abilities and Human Resources evaluates legal implications of the "general questions" section of the employment application. The committee **shall not** in the paper screening, interview or reference checking processes disqualify or evaluate a candidate based on responses to these questions. Sometimes the candidate makes mistakes in their answers or the legal implications have no negative impact on employment. If there is a cause for concern after Human Resources completes its responsibility in legal compliance, the appropriate administrator will be notified.

Note: The Chancellor may choose to use another reference checking process for positions reporting to the Chancellor.

B. Reference Checking Period

The goal is to assess the candidate's work history and work ethic during the last five years. If they haven't worked during this period, find out what the candidate has done during the last five years if not indicated on the application. You may have to go beyond the last five years to obtain three references.

C. Responsibility of Making References

Reference checking may be completed by the committee chair or several committee members. This is the committee's decision. However, there are basic rules to follow:

1. All questions must be asked of each reference for each finalist; do not skip over questions, ask them all. Do not add your own questions.

2. If several people are involved in the process, one person must call all references for one finalist. Do not split up reference checks for each candidate as at least one committee member must see all references for the finalist.
3. Three references are required from current and former supervisors.
4. If you are unable to reach a reference after trying several times, complete the reference checking form and make a notation.
5. If you contact a reference and they refuse to give you one, complete the reference checking form and make a notation. Try to explore why; this may be a red flag.
6. Include all comments, both positive and negative; we must obtain a balanced reference.
7. If you have a negative reference, you may want to conduct more than three references to assure a thorough reference.
8. Submit all completed successful and unsuccessful reference checking forms.

D. Reference Checking Steps

1. Review the Reference Release section located on the last page of the employment application. **(See Appendix M)** Follow the directions of the finalist. The finalist has either provided a release to contact all and current supervisors or to notify them first before contacting references. If the finalist has selected the latter, notify the finalist and indicate that you are in the next phase of the selection process and you are going to begin calling references.

2. If the finalist adds a notation to this section that says not to call his / her current supervisor, you may honor their request at this time. However, you need to inform the finalist that if he/she is the finalist candidate after the second interviews, that the current supervisor must be contacted to complete the reference checking process. This step will be completed by the President.

3. Call three supervisory references located in the "Experience" section of the employment application. In some cases, the finalist has not worked at three different organizations. For example, you may have to contact more than one manager they worked for at the same location or you may call where they volunteered, etc. You may have to become creative in obtaining your references.

4. If the finalist does not provide names and phone numbers of supervisors, contact the finalist to let them know you are completing the next phase of the selection process and you are going to call references and you need to obtain names, titles and phone numbers of current and former supervisors.

5. Character references cannot replace supervisor references when there are current and former supervisors listed in the "Experience" section.

6. In some situations, the supervisor is deceased, no longer working at the business, or the business is defunct. In these cases, you may have to speak to another colleague or another supervisor who knows of the finalist and their work ethic.

7. It is acceptable to obtain references via email and FAX. If one of these options is selected, send them a copy of the reference check form because we want them to answer the same questions as any other reference. For example, it is not acceptable to simply email a statement concerning the finalist.

8. Document employment history, obtain the name, job title, and name of organization of the reference you are seeking. Compare this information to the work history provided in the employment application. Is it the same? Clarify, if necessary.

9. Do not expect to complete the reference checking in one day; it may take several days to complete a thorough reference check for a finalist.

10. If you are having difficulty in obtaining a thorough reference check or you have questions or concerns, please contact Human Resources for assistance.

Note: An incomplete reference check process will result in the returning of documents for completion.

STEP 12 – Recommendation Of Employment (Appendix N)

After the references are completed, you must complete the Recommendation of Employment form **(Appendix N)**. The purpose of the recommendation of employment form is to document who was interviewed, the names of the committee members, the recommended finalists, the selected candidate, and the job offer. All candidates selected for a finalist interview sends a message to the President that any of the candidates are highly qualified and would contribute to the overall effectiveness of the college and the District.

Steps to follow to complete the Recommendation of Employment process:

Step 1:

- Identify the candidates who were interviewed (those that made their appointments). You may submit a copy of the interview schedule providing you document the no shows.
- Confirm the names of the committee members who participated in all of the interviews.
- Identify two to three finalists.
- Complete the justification for recommendation of each candidate.
- Attach all applications, interview rating forms and notes, teaching demonstration documents and any other documents used in the interview process.
- Submit all of the above in a **separate envelope** to the Administrative Specialist for Personnel.

Step 2:

- Complete a statement on the strengths and weaknesses of the finalists **(Appendix N-1)**.
- Completion of the reference checking forms.
- Submit all of the above in a **separate envelope** to the Administrative Specialist for Personnel.

The Administrative Specialist for Personnel will forward the envelopes to Human Resources.

The Human Resources Department shall review all selection documentation and certify the process, remove all documentation unrelated to the finalists, and forward both envelopes to the President.

The Human Resources Department will send letters to the non-selected applicants from the first interview.

Congratulations! Your commitment to the process is appreciated!

STEP 13 – Finalist Interviews

The finalists interviews are conducted by the Chancellor, Vice Chancellor, President or designee as appropriate for all administrative positions. The finalists interviews for classified positions are conducted by the Vice Presidents or designee.

The finalists interviews are conducted by the appropriate administrator noted above. The first interview committee chair or designee will participate in the finalists interviews. Others may be invited as appropriate.

The appropriate administrator noted above is responsible for identifying the selection criteria, the interview questions, and the rating form for the finalists interviews. Approval of the documents to be used in the finalists interviews is required by the Human Resources Department.

The appropriate administrator noted above should review the questions of the first committee interviews to develop the selection criteria, interview questions and rating mechanism. The appropriate administrator is responsible for developing broad based questions that include the needs of students, the college, and the District.

The finalists interview committee shall review the contents of the Step 1 envelope prior to the interviews. The Step 2 envelope may not be opened until the deliberation process.

The appropriate administrator noted above is responsible for making all arrangements for scheduling the finalists interviews. The finalists may not preview the interview questions.

Management: Finalists traveling more than 400 miles will receive reimbursement for an economy air flight, one night's lodging (maximum of $100), and one day's car rental (maximum of $75). The President shall inform the finalists of the reimbursement information and provide them with a reimbursement form **(Appendix O)** at the time of the interview. To be reimbursed, the finalists must submit the form and the original receipts directly to the Human Resources Department, Francine Caracciolo, Executive Coordinator, for processing. Restricted staff diversity funds are used for this purpose.

After the interviews, the committee shall deliberate on the finalists. At this point, the committee shall review the contents of the Step 2 envelope.

The appropriate administrator noted above shall submit all selection documents to include the name of the recommended finalist on the Recommendation of Employment form and a written justification for the selection to the Administrative Specialist for Personnel who will forward to the Human Resources Department.

Special Interview Components:

The Chancellor may choose to hold and/or include special interview components, such as forums, visitations to the candidate's current workplace, etc.

STEP 15 – Job Offer

Only the staff in the Human Resources Department may make a job offer. Prior to making a job offer the Human Resources Department will perform the following steps:

- Review the names of the committee members and confirm submission of interview rating forms for the first and finalists interviews. Assure there are rating forms for all committee members, rating forms are totaled and forms are signed.
- Review reference check process to ensure an adequate reference checking process has been conducted. Review responses to questions and assess responses. May follow-up with recommending parties to assure the references were reviewed and the responses have been evaluated.

- Reaffirm the candidate meets the minimum qualifications and/or equivalent qualifications. Ensure equivalency documentation has been completed appropriately. If candidate was recommended based on a California Community College Credential, the credential will be reviewed to determine if it is valid and in the appropriate discipline.
- Reaffirm required college degrees are from accredited institutions.
- Review employment application to ensure candidate has signed the application.
- Review "general questions" section and follow-up, if necessary. May need to contact candidate regarding their responses. If there is a problem that would impact the selection, the Associate Vice Chancellor of Human Resources will contact the college President.

The Human Resources Department will make the job offer contingent upon Governing Board approval and determine if any ADA accommodation is required. If the finalist accepts, Human Resources will contact the Administrative Specialist for Personnel who will notify the President and the committee chair. The Human Resources Department will contact the other finalists by phone to inform them a selection has been made. Human Resources will also send a follow-up letter to confirm the selection.

Step 16 – APPOINTMENT

The Human Resources Department will prepare the Governing Board agenda item and notify the finalist of the contingent offer. After Governing Board approval, Human Resources will notify the employee by letter to confirm the appointment.

Questions from candidates:

Refer all calls to Human Resources. Do not discuss a candidate's interview with anyone, not even the candidate.

Reviewed by District Council 4/12/06